Truth and reconciliation in research: physical activity interventions with Indigenous communities

Lucie Lévesque, Ph.D.
Queen’s University
Anishinaabe and Haudenosaunee Territories

June 7th, 2017, Lekwungen territory
All research takes place within the settler colonial context.

“Research is a dirty word”

Cleaning up our research act

Reconciliatory community engaged research
All research takes place within the settler colonial context
European Arrival: Stages of Colonization

Stage 1: Protection
- Indigenous Nations recognized through Royal Proclamation (1763) and treaties
- Relationships develop from:

(Tobias, 1991, Miller, 2000)
Stage 1: Protection

- Indigenous Nations recognized through Royal Proclamation (1763) and treaties
- Relationships develop from:

Military Alliances

(Tobias, 1991, Miller, 2000)
European Arrival: Stages of Colonization

Stage 1: Protection
- Indigenous Nations recognized through Royal Proclamation (1763) and treaties
- Relationships develop from:

Religion

(Tobias, 1991, Miller, 2000)
European Arrival: Stages of Colonization

Stage 2: Civilization

- E.g. Indian Act (1876 – present)

1. Governed Indian “status”
2. Unable to use mechanical farm equipment
3. Ceremonies Became Illegal

(Anaya, 2014; Tobias, 1991)
European Arrival: Stages of Colonization

Stage 3: Assimilation

- E.g. Residential Schools (1830’s – 1996)
- E.g. The Sixties Scoop

(Tobias, 1991; TRC, 2015)
Colonisation through Categorization and Language

Aboriginal Peoples → Indigenous Peoples → First Nations, Métis, and Inuit Peoples → Nations: people

(Alfred and Corntassel, 2005)
Colonisation through Categorization and Language

Aboriginal Peoples → Indigenous Peoples → First Nations, Métis, and Inuit Peoples → Nations: Lekwungen peoples

Supports the legal and political agenda of the Canadian government

(Alfred and Corntassel, 2005)
Colonisation through Categorization and Language

Aboriginal Peoples → Indigenous Peoples → First Nations, Métis, and Inuit Peoples → Nations: Lekwungen peoples

Consistent with international organizations like the United Nations

(Alfred and Corntassel, 2005)
Colonisation through Categorization and Language

Aboriginal Peoples → Indigenous Peoples → First Nations, Métis, and Inuit Peoples → Nations: Lekwungen peoples

Recognizes the sociocultural, historical, and colonial context unique to different Indigenous peoples

(Alfred and Corntassel, 2005)
Colonisation through Categorization and Language

Aboriginal Peoples → Indigenous Peoples → First Nations, Métis, and Inuit Peoples → Nations: Lekwungen peoples

Recognizes Nation to Nation relationship and treaty obligations

(Alfred and Corntassel, 2005)
Demographics of Indigenous peoples in Canada today

1.4 million people self-identify as Indigenous

- Represent over 60 different language and cultural groups
- 61% First Nations Peoples
- 32% Métis Peoples
- 4% Inuit Peoples

(FNIGC, 2012; Statistics Canada, 2011)
Demographics of Indigenous peoples in Canada today

Indigenous population grew by over 20% from 2006-2011

28% under 14 years

56% live in urban centres

(FNIGC, 2012; Statistics Canada, 2011)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Nation</th>
<th>Setting</th>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>PA</th>
<th>Citation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children and Youth (10-13 years)</td>
<td>First Nations</td>
<td>Reserve, Saskatchewan</td>
<td>7-Day Recall</td>
<td>7.4% = &gt;60 min MVPA/day</td>
<td>Lemstra et al., 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth (12-17 years)</td>
<td>First Nations</td>
<td>Rural and Reserve, Canada</td>
<td>Questionnaire – 20 PA items</td>
<td>65% = &gt;60 min MVPA/day</td>
<td>Janssen et al., 2014; Lévesque et al., 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adults (20-64 years)</td>
<td>Métis</td>
<td>Rural and Urban, Canada</td>
<td>Questionnaire – 1 PA item</td>
<td>51.3% = 3+ hours LTPA</td>
<td>Ryan et al., 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adults (18+ years)</td>
<td>Inuit</td>
<td>Rural and Urban, Canada</td>
<td>Questionnaire – 6 PA items</td>
<td>51% = Active LTPA</td>
<td>Gionet et al., 2013</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Health and wellness among Indigenous peoples in Canada

(CCHS, 2007; Statistics Canada, 2012)
Socio-economic determinants of health and wellness

- 25.3% met low-income threshold criteria
- 17.4% of houses required major structural repairs
- 38% of Indigenous people do not complete secondary school

(Kolahdooz et al., 2015)
Topic 2

“Research is a dirty word”
“From the vantage point of the colonized, a position from which I write, and choose to privilege, the term 'research' is inextricably linked to European imperialism and colonialism. The word itself, 'research', is probably one of the dirtiest words in the indigenous world’s vocabulary... ” - Linda Tuhiwai Smith, Maori Scholar (1999)
Canada’s shameful history of colonial research on residential school children

Canadian researchers used Cree First Nations children in residential schools and adults and Elders in communities to learn about malnutrition

- the basics of alleviating malnutrition (adequate food) were well known even before these experiments began
- controlled experiments on vitamin supplementation were conducted without informed consent or knowledge
- emergency food relief, badly needed in some cases, was withheld

“Outside research teams swooped down from the skies, swarmed all over town, asked nosy questions that were none of their business and then disappeared never to be heard of again”

- Louis T. Montour MD, 1987
Cleaning up our research act
Policy Responses / Recommendations

- CIHR Guidelines for health research involving Aboriginal peoples 2007
- TCPS-2: Chapter 9, 2010 (2014)
- NAHO/OCAP® 2005
- TRC, 2015
ARTICLE 19: States shall consult and cooperate in good faith with the Indigenous peoples concerned through their own representative institutions in order to obtain their free, prior and informed consent before adopting and implementing legislative or administrative measures that may affect them.

ARTICLE 31: Indigenous peoples have the right to maintain, control, protect and develop their cultural heritage, traditional knowledge and traditional cultural expressions, as well as the manifestations of their sciences, technologies and cultures...
Article 1

A researcher should understand and respect Aboriginal world views, including responsibilities to the people and culture that flow from being granted access to traditional or sacred knowledge. These should be incorporated into research agreements, to the extent possible.
This chapter acknowledges the unique status of the Aboriginal peoples of Canada. It interprets how the value of respect for human dignity and the core principles of Respect for Persons, Concern for Welfare, and Justice (as articulated in Chapter 1) apply to research involving Aboriginal peoples. It accords respect to Aboriginal peoples’ knowledge systems by ensuring that the various and distinct world views of Indian, Inuit and Métis peoples are represented in planning and decision making, from the earliest stages of conception and design of projects through to the analysis and dissemination of results. It affirms respect for community customs and codes of research practice to better ensure balance in the relationship between researchers and participants, and mutual benefit in researcher-community relations.
**Ownership:** a community or group owns information collectively in the same way that an individual owns his or her personal information.

**Control:** affirms that Aboriginal communities are within their rights in seeking control over all aspects of the research process.

**Access:** Aboriginal peoples must have access to information/data about themselves and their communities, regardless of where it is currently held. The right of Aboriginal communities to manage and make decisions regarding access to their information and resources.

**Possession:** Actual physical control of data (ownership identifies the relationship between people and their information). A mechanism by which ownership can be asserted and protected. Most legally significant of all the OCAP principles.
Six Principles of Métis Research

Six Principles of Métis Health Research:
Ethical Principles to Guide the Métis Centre in its Work

Think Tank on Métis-Specific Research Ethics

1. Reciprocal Relationships: Building relationships between researchers & communities, while sharing responsibility & benefits, & learning from each other.

2. Recognize Diversity: Within & between Métis communities; in worldviews; in values & beliefs; in geographic orientation & in politics.

3. Respect For: Individual & collective; autonomy; identity; personal values; gender; confidentiality; practices & protocols.

4. “Research Should” Be relevant; benefit all; accurate; accountable; responsible; acknowledge contribution; & protect Métis cultural knowledge.

5. Safe & Inclusive Environments: Research should be safe for all – youth & Elders; gender & sexual identity; aboriginality; & balance individual & collective.

6. Métis Context: Understand history, values, & knowledge; advance Métis methodology & include Métis experts; straddle worldviews; & insider-outsider perspective.

For more information please contact:
Devin Dietrich, Research Officer, Métis Centre of NAHO, ddietrich@naho.ca

www.naho.ca/metiscentre
Inuit-Specific Perspectives on Research and Research Ethics

Inuit-specific ethics recommendations are...
• Acknowledge that the current state of Aboriginal health in Canada is a direct result of previous Canadian government policies including residential schools
• Repudiate concepts used to justify European sovereignty over Indigenous lands and peoples
• Ensure skills-based training in intercultural competency, conflict resolution, human rights, and anti-racism
• Adopt and implement the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (free, prior, and informed consent)
Topic 4

Reconciliatory community engaged research
Western epistemology: individualistic

- Decisions are made with the self in mind
- We adhere to a class system= power and control
- Built environment and technology are prioritized over nature
- We have a tendency to silo and compartmentalize
- Ways of knowing are physical and cognitive
- We value a positivist epistemology
Indigenous epistemologies: sacred interconnectedness

- 7th generations thinking
- Egalitarian system
- View everything as connected
- Relationships with Mother Earth and all life is critical
- Wellness is living in balance - wholistic mind-body-spirit connection
- Constructivist / interpretivist epistemology

Simpson, 2000
Epistemological ethnocentrism

When Indigenous knowledge is judged by Western standards of validity, reliability, and credibility, it can lead to:

- Assimilation of Indigenous knowledge into Western frameworks
- Preference for Indigenous research that is considered to be consistent with Western standards
- View of Indigenous research as ‘primitive’
- Devaluing of Indigenous research

“Ways Tried and True (WTT) refers to public health interventions that have been developed with or by Aboriginal communities and have demonstrated a positive effect on target groups”.

These interventions have undergone a rigorous, culturally-relevant assessment process based on the following six criteria:

- basis in the community
- wholistic approach
- integration of Indigenous cultural knowledge
- building on community strengths and needs
- partnership/collaboration
- demonstrated effectiveness

Accepted standards of evidence include both Aboriginal and academic research approaches.
Two-Eyed Seeing

"... learning to see from one eye with the strengths of Indigenous knowledges and ways of knowing, and from the other eye with the strengths of Western knowledges and ways of knowing ... and learning to use both these eyes together, for the benefit of all"

Albert Marshall, 2004
Western and Indigenous concepts

Socio-Ecological Model

Policy, Systems, Environments
- nation, state, local laws

Community

Organizational
- organizations, social institutions

Interpersonal
- family, friends, social

Individual
- knowledge, attitudes, skills
An Integrated Indigenous-Ecological Framework to promote PA and health in Indigenous communities

Sport, Recreation and Physical Activity opportunities delivered via a decolonizing approach at each ecological leverage point


Micro-aggressions

- Being asked about negative stereotypes around taxes, free housing, treaties, etc.
- Feeling “invisible” to non-Aboriginal people, at work, at school, in public
- Feeling compelled to teach basic history to non-Aboriginal people to make your viewpoint heard
- Being challenged on the basis of one’s appearance (“you don’t look Indian”)
- Hearing how surprisingly articulate, well-read, or good your language skills are
- Hearing discussions by persons in authority about Aboriginal people in a negative light

Clark et al., 2014; Sue, Capodilupo & Holder, 2008.
Examples of PA intervention program research
Aboriginal Youth Mentorship Program (AYMP) 2006-

- Recognized best practice: *Aboriginal Ways Tried and True* (PHAC)
- RCT evidence of improvements on WC, BMI
- Programs in 10+ communities
Active Circle: 2010-2015
Understanding Positive Youth Development

Phase 1: Indexed Journals
Phase 2: Non-Indexed Indigenous Journals
Phase 3: Grey Literature

Example Themes:
- Traditional Culture and Values
- Empowerment
- Mental Health and Resiliency
- Research
- Effectiveness
- Implementation
- Adoption
- Maintenance
- Reach

Effectiveness (73%)
Implementation (30%)
Maintenance (43%)
Reach (34%)
Adoption (48%)

(Baillie et al., 2017; Bruner et al., 2015)
Active Circle: PA environment assessment

Active Circle: Validation of Wholistic Compass

(Bruner et al., forthcoming)
Kahnawake Schools Diabetes Prevention Project (KSDPP) 1994-

- Recognized best practice: *Aboriginal Ways Tried and True* (PHAC)
- 40+ students trained
- 50+ peer reviewed publications
- 200+ presentations
Explore PA programs implemented as part of the KSDPP

- Community-Level Interventions (n=4)
- Interpersonal-Level Interventions (n=23)
- Organizational-Level Interventions (n=10)
- Individual-Level Interventions (n=8)

KSDPP: Reflecting on governance


KSDPP: Reflecting on research

All research takes place within the settler colonial context.

“Research is a dirty word.”

Cleaning up our research act.

Reconciliatory community engaged research.

Key Topics
Acknowledgments

- Communities, Elders, Students, Colleagues
- Colin Baillie, PhD candidate
- Alex M. McComber, DSc (Hon)